

Plato's Letters Evidence for the History of the Academy?

- 01** 13 letters under the name of Plato within the tetralogical order of his works
Sicilian: *Ep.* 1,3,4,7,8,13 – Pythagorizing: 2,9,12 – Others: 5,6,10,11
- 02** *Ep. 7: To Dio's comrades and friends* (supposed to be written 354)
- | | |
|-------------|--|
| 324b7–330c6 | 1. <i>Events until the end of the Second journey</i> |
| 324b7–26b2 | 1.1 Plato's attitude towards politics out of the events in his youth |
| 326b4–27b5 | 1.2 First journey (388) |
| 327b6–30c6 | 1.3 Second journey (autumn 366) |
| 330c7–337e3 | 2. <i>Advice</i> |
| 330c7–31d4 | 2.1 How to give advice |
| 331d5–33c6 | 2.2 The advice given to Dionysius II by Dio and Plato |
| 333d7–34c2 | 2.3 Second journey and Dio marching towards Syracuse |
| 334c3–37e3 | 2.4 Advice |
| 337e4–351e3 | 3. <i>The Third journey and events immediately afterwards</i> |
| 337e4–40a5 | 3.1 Third journey (spring 361 to summer 360) I: Why Plato felt obliged to travel once again |
| 340b1–45c2 | 3.2 How Plato and philosophy failed
,peira' (340b1–42a5), philosophical digression (342a6–45c2) |
| 345c3–50b5 | 3.3 Third journey II: Further events during Plato's third stay |
| 350b6–51e2 | 3.4 What happened after Plato left. |
- 03** *Recurrent features in (auto-)biographical writing in Classical times*
- a) Politics
 - b) Apology
 - c) *ethos* of the speaker/person in question
 - d) Resumé of one's life ("Lebenssumme")
 - e) Literary techniques found regularly: i. the (auto-)biographical information in *digression*,
ii. independent of chronological order, iii. biographical elements side autobiographical ones
- 04** *Ep. 13: To Dionysius* (not before 365)
- | | |
|-------------|---|
| 360b5–360c2 | 1. <i>What Plato is sending to Dionysius</i> |
| 360b5–e3 | 1.1 Philosophical items: Books, Helicon |
| 361a1–b3 | 1.2 Other items: Statue of Apollo, statue for D.' wife, wine and honey for the children |
| 361b4–c2 | 1.3 Plato cares for his friend |
| 361c2–362e1 | 2. <i>Plato's and Dionysius' financial affairs</i> |
| 361c2–6 | 2.1 How Plato acts as Dionysius' financial solicitor |
| 361c6–362a1 | 2.2 What Plato himself has to afford |
| 361c6–e3 | 2.2.1 dowries for his nieces' daughters |
| 361e3–5 | 2.2.2 funeral of his mother (in case of her death) |
| 361e5–362a1 | 2.2.3 travel fare for his journey to Dionysius II |
| 362a2–e1 | 2.3 Dionysius' financial affairs |
| 362a2–7 | 2.3.1 No Athenian is willing to lend money (<i>choregia</i>) |
| 362a7–c3 | 2.3.2 This is a shame: Erastos to Andromedes |
| 362c3–e1 | 2.3.3 Advice: How D. should use his money in future times |
| 362e2–c7 | 3. <i>Other topics of interest</i> |
| 362e3–7 | 3.1 Dio |
| 363a1–7 | 3.2 Armour for Cratinus, Chitons for Kebes' daughters |
| 363b1–5 | 3.3 The <i>symbolon</i> of the letter |
| 363b6–c3 | 3.4 Ambassadors praise Dionysius |
| 363c4–6 | 3.5 Terillus |

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13		
FICINO 1484	?	+ MAJOR PART GENUINE +											-?		
Bentley 1697	+ ALL GENUINE +														
Meiners 1783	- ALL SPURIOUS-														
Boekh 1808	-	-	+	-	-	-	+	+	-	-	-	-	-		
Ast 1816	- ALL SPURIOUS-														
Karsten 1864	- ALL SPURIOUS-														
Grote 1865	-	+ ALMOST ALL GENUINE +													
Christ 1885	-	+ ALMOST ALL GENUINE +													
Blass <i>Att.Bered.</i>	-	+ MAJOR PART GENUINE +										+/-?	+		
Raeder 1906	-	+ ALMOST ALL GENUINE +													
Zeller <i>Gesch.Phil.</i>	- ALL SPURIOUS-														
Adam 1906. 1910	- ALMOST ALL SPURIOUS-						+	- ALMOST ALL SPURIOUS-							
Ritter 1910	-	-	+	?	-	-	+	+	-	-	-	-	-		
Hackforth 1913	-	-	+	+	-	-	+	+	?	?	?	-	+		
APELT 1918. ² 1921	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	+		
v. Wilamowitz 1920	-	-	-	-	-	+	+	+	-	-	?	-	-		
ANDREAE 1923	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	-		
HOWALD 1923. ² 1951	-	-	-	-	-	+	+	+	-	-	-	-	-		
Burnet 1924	-	+	+		+		+	+					+		
POST 1925	-	+	+	+	-	+	+	+	-	+	+	-	+		
Taylor 1926. ² 1937	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	+	+	-	+		
SOUILHÉ 1926. ² 1949	- MAJOR PART SPURIOUS-						+	+	- MAJOR PART SPURIOUS-						
Bury 1929	- MAJOR PART SPURIOUS-						+	+	- MAJOR PART SPURIOUS-						
Field 1930	-	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	+		
NOVOTNÝ 1930	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+		
Harward 1932	-	+	+	?	?	+	+	+	?	?	?	?	+		
MORROW 1935. ² 1962	-	-	?	+	?	+	+	+	-	+	-	-	?		
PASQUALI 1938. ² 1961	-	-	-	-	-	+	+	+	-	?	+	+	-		
Weinstock 1947	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	-		
Bluck 1947	-	+ ALMOST ALL GENUINE +													
Boas 1948	- ALL SPURIOUS-														
MADDALENA 1948	- ALL SPURIOUS-														
Robin 1950	-	-	-	-	-	?	+	+	-	-	-	-	-		
Berve 1957	-	-	?/-	-			+	+					?/-		
Edelstein 1966	- ALL SPURIOUS-														
NEUMANN 1967	-	-	-	-	-	+	+	+	-	-	+	-	-		
Dörrie 1970															
Aalders 1971	-	?	?	-	-	?	+	+	-	-	?	-	-		
Gulley 1971	- ALL SPURIOUS-														
Von Fritz 1971								+	?						
Westlake 1979								+	?	+	?				
Thesleff 1982	- ALMOST ALL SPURIOUS-						+	?	- ALMOST ALL SPURIOUS-						
Ledger 1989	-	+	?					+	+	?				+	
Trampedach 1994							+	?	+	?					
Muccioli 1999	-	-	+/-?	+/-?			+	?	+	?	-			+/-?	
ISNARDI PARENTE 2002	-	-	-	-	-	-	+	+	?	-	-	-	-		
BRISSON ⁴ 2004	-	-	-	-	-	-	+	+/-?	+/-?	-	-	-	-		
Nails 2002	- MAJOR PART SPURIOUS						+	+	- MAJOR PART SPURIOUS-						
Huffman 2005								+	?					+	
Erler 2007	-	-	-	-	-	-	+	?	+/-?	-	+/-?	+/-?	-		

“Epistle 7 is nowadays accepted by the majority of scholars [...] it hardly seems necessary to rehearse once more the arguments pro and contra. The importance of having its authenticity confirmed is that it will now be possible to rely on the long excursus on the nature of reality (342A-344C) with confidence as a guide to Plato's later thoughts”, Ledger, 1989, p.25, quoted by Sayre 1995, xxiii

05a Ep. 7, beginning (323d7–24b6, transl. Bury)

Πλάτων τοῖς Δίωνος οἰκείοις τε καὶ ἐταίροις εὖ πράττειν.

Ἐπεστείλατέ μοι νομίζειν δεῖν τὴν διάνοιαν ὑμῶν εἶναι τὴν αὐτὴν ἣν εἶχεν καὶ Δίων, καὶ δὴ καὶ κοινωνεῖν διεκελεύεσθέ (324.a) μοι, καθ' ὅσον οἶός τέ εἰμι ἔργῳ καὶ λόγῳ. ἐγὼ δέ, εἰ μὲν δόξαν καὶ ἐπιθυμίαν τὴν αὐτὴν ἔχετε ἐκείνῳ, σύμφημι κοινῶ νήσειν, εἰ δὲ μή, βουλευέσεσθαι πολλάκις. τίς δ' ἦν ἡ ἐκείνου διάνοια καὶ ἐπιθυμία, σχεδὸν οὐκ εἰκάζων ἀλλ' ὡς εἰδὼς σαφῶς εἶπομι' ἄν. – ὅτε γὰρ κατ' ἀρχὰς εἰς Συρακούσας ἐγὼ ἀφικόμην, σχεδὸν ἔτη τετταράκοντα γεγονώς, Δίων εἶχε τὴν ἡλικίαν ἣν τὰ νῦν Ἰππαρίνος γέγονεν, καὶ ἦν ἔσχεν (324.b) τότε δόξαν, ταύτην καὶ διετέλεσεν ἔχων, Συρακοσίους οἶεσθαι δεῖν ἐλευθέρους εἶναι κατὰ νόμους τοὺς ἀρίστους οἰκοῦντας. ὥστε οὐδὲν θαυμαστὸν εἶ τις θεῶν καὶ τοῦτον εἰς τὴν αὐτὴν δόξαν περὶ πολιτείας ἐκείνῳ γενέσθαι σύμφρονα ποιήσειεν. τίς δ' ἦν ὁ τρόπος τῆς γενέσεως αὐτῆς, οὐκ ἀπάξιον ἀκοῦσαι νέῳ καὶ μὴ νέῳ, πειράσομαι δὲ ἐξ ἀρχῆς αὐτὴν ἐγὼ πρὸς ὑμᾶς διεξελθεῖν· ἔχει γὰρ καιρὸν τὰ νῦν.

You wrote to me that I ought to consider that your policy was the same as that which Dion had; and moreover you charged me to support it, so far as I can, [324a] both by deed and word. Now if you really hold the same views and aims as he, I consent to support them, but if not, I will ponder the matter many times over. And what was his policy and his aim I will tell you, and that, as I may say, not from mere conjecture but from certain knowledge. – For when I originally arrived at Syracuse, being about forty years old, Dion was of the age which Hipparinus has now reached, and the views which he had then come to hold [324b] he continued to hold unchanged; for he believed that the Syracusans ought to be free and dwell under the best laws. Consequently, it is no matter of surprise if some Deity has made Hipparinus also come to share his views about government and be of the same mind. Now the manner in which these views originated is a story well worth hearing for young and old alike, and I shall endeavor to narrate it to you from the beginning; for at the present moment it is opportune.

05b Ep. 7, end (352a1–6)

What counsel I have to offer, after this narrative of events, [352a] has been given already, and so let it suffice. But I deemed it necessary to explain the reasons why I undertook my second journey to Sicily because absurd and irrational stories are being told about it. If, therefore, the account I have now given appears to anyone more rational, and if anyone believes that it supplies sufficient excuses for what took place, then I shall regard that account as both reasonable and sufficient.

06a Isokrates, Or. 15,6 (transl. Norlin)

Ἦισθημένος δ' ὥσπερ εἶπον, πλείους ὄντας ὧν ὄμην τοὺς οὐκ ὀρθῶς περὶ μου γινώσκοντας, ἐνεθυμούμην πῶς ἂν δηλώσαιμι καὶ τούτοις καὶ τοῖς ἐπιγιγνομένοις καὶ τὸν τρόπον ὃν ἔχω, καὶ τὸν βίον ὃν ζῶ, καὶ τὴν παιδείαν περὶ ἣν διατρίβω, καὶ μὴ περιίδοιμι περὶ τῶν τοιούτων ἄκριτον ἔμαυτὸν ὄντα, μηδ' ἐπὶ τοῖς βλασφημεῖν εἰθισμένοις ὥσπερ νῦν γενόμενον.

But when my eyes were opened, as I have said, to the fact that a greater number than I supposed had mistaken ideas about me, I began to ponder how I could show to them and to posterity the truth about my character, my way of life, and the education to which I am devoted, and not suffer myself to be condemned on these issues without a trial nor to remain, as I had just been, at the mercy of my habitual calumniators.

06b Isokrates, Or. 15,8 (transl. Norlin)

Εἰ μὲν οὖν ἐπαινεῖν ἔμαυτὸν ἐπιχειροῖην, ἐώρων οὔτε περιλαβεῖν ἅπαντα περὶ ὧν διελεθεῖν προηρούμην οἶός τε γενησόμενος, οὔτ' ἐπιχαρίτως οὔδ' ἀνεπιφθόνως εἰπεῖν περὶ αὐτῶν δυνασόμενος· εἰ δ' ὑποθείμην ἀγῶνα μὲν καὶ κίνδυνόν τινα περὶ ἐμὲ γινόμενον, ... ἔμαυτὸν δ' ἐν ἀπολογίας σχήματι τοὺς λόγους ποιούμενον, οὔτως ἂν ἐκγενέσθαι μοι μάλιστα διαλεχθῆναι περὶ ἀπάντων ὧν τυγχάνω βουλόμενος.

I saw, however, that if I were to attempt a eulogy of myself, I should not be able to cover all the points which I proposed to discuss, nor should I succeed in treating them without arousing the displeasure or even the envy of my hearers. But it occurred to me that if I were to adopt the fiction of a trial and of a suit brought against me... in this way it would be possible to discuss to the best advantage all the points which I wanted to make.

07 Plato, Apol. 32b8–e4 (transl. Fowler)

... μετὰ τοῦ (32.c) νόμου καὶ τοῦ δικαίου ὄμην μᾶλλον με δεῖν διακινδυνεύειν ἢ μεθ' ὑμῶν γενέσθαι μὴ δίκαια βουλευομένων, φοβηθέντα δεσμῶν ἢ θάνατον. καὶ ταῦτα μὲν ἦν ἔτι δημοκρατουμένης τῆς πόλεως· ἐπειδὴ δὲ ὀλιγαρχία ἐγένετο, οἱ τριάκοντα αὖ μεταπεμνόμενοι με... [*Leon of Salamis*] ... τότε μέντοι ἐγὼ (32.d) οὐ λόγῳ ἀλλ' ἔργῳ αὖ ἐνεδειξάμην ὅτι ἐμοὶ θανάτου μὲν μέλει, εἰ μὴ ἀγροικότερον ἦν εἰπεῖν, οὔδ' ὅτι οὖν, τοῦ δὲ μηδὲν ἄδικον μηδ' ἀνόσιον ἐργάζεσθαι, τούτου δὲ τὸ πᾶν μέλει. ... [*Leon of Salamis*] ...

Ἄρ' οὖν ἂν με οἴεσθε τοσάδε ἔτη διαγενέσθαι εἰ ἔπραττον τὰ δημόσια καὶ πράττων ἀξίως ἀνδρὸς ἀγαθοῦ ἐβόηθουν τοῖς δικαίοις καὶ ὡσπερ χρῆ τοῦτο περὶ πλείστου ἐποιοῦμην;

I thought ...[32c] I must run the risk to the end with law and justice on my side, rather than join with you when your wishes were unjust, through fear of imprisonment or death. That was when the democracy still existed; and after the oligarchy was established, the Thirty sent for me ... [*Leon of Salamis I*]... Then I, however, [32d] showed again, by action, not in word only, that I did not care a whit for death if that be not too rude an expression, but that I did care with all my might not to do anything unjust or unholy. ... [*Leon of Salamis II*] ... – Do you believe that I could have lived so many years if I had been in public life and had acted as a good man should act, lending my aid to what is just and considering that of the highest importance?

I. *prooemium* (17a1–18a6) – II. *dispositio* (18a7–19a7) –III. *refutatio* (19a8–28b2): a. old prosecutors, b. new prosecutors: Meletus –IV. *digressio* (28b3–34b5) –V. *peroratio* (34b6–35d8)

08 Ep. 7: Plato's Youth

In the days of my youth my experience was the same as that of many others (πολλοῖς δὴ ταῦτόν ἔπαθον). I thought that as soon as I should become my own master (εἰ θάπτον ἐμαυτοῦ γενοίμην κύριος) [324c] I would immediately enter into public life. But it so happened, I found, that the following changes occurred in the political situation (τύχαι): [*The revolution of the 'Thirty'*] [324d] ... Now of these some were actually connections and acquaintances of mine; and indeed they invited me at once to join their administration, thinking it would be congenial. ... And indeed I saw how these men within a short time caused men to look back on the former government as a golden age; and above all how they treated my [324e] aged friend Socrates, whom I would hardly scruple to call the most just of men then living, ... [*the Leon-affair*]... So when I beheld all these actions and others of a similar grave kind, I was indignant, and I withdrew myself from the evil practices then going on. ... [*after the Thirty*]... Then once again I was really, though less urgently, impelled with a desire to take part in public and [325b] political affairs. Many deplorable events, however, were still happening in those times, [...] But, as ill-luck would have it, certain men of authority (δυναστεύοντες τινες) summoned our comrade **Socrates** before the law-courts, laying a charge against him which was most unholy, and which **Socrates** of all men least deserved; [325c] for it was on the charge of impiety that those men summoned him and the rest condemned and slew him—the very man who on the former occasion, when they themselves had the misfortune to be in exile, had refused to take part in the unholy arrest of one of the friends of the men then exiled.

When, therefore, I considered all this, ... and the more I advanced in years myself, the more difficult appeared to me [325d] the task of managing affairs of State rightly. For it was impossible to take action without friends and trusty companions; and these it was not easy to find ready to hand .. [*the corruption of the state*]..., Consequently, although at first [325e] I was filled with an ardent desire (ἐπιθυμία) to engage in public affairs, when I considered all this and saw how things were shifting about anyhow in all directions, I finally became dizzy; ... [326a] ... as regards political action I kept constantly waiting for an opportune moment; until, finally, looking at all the States which now exist, I perceived that one and all they are badly governed; for the state of their laws is such as to be almost incurable without some marvellous overhauling and good-luck to boot. So in my praise of the right philosophy I was compelled to declare that by it one is enabled to discern all forms of justice both political and individual. Wherefore the classes of mankind (I said) will have no cessation from evils until either the class of those [326b] who are right and true philosophers attains political supremacy, or else the class of those who hold power in the States becomes, by some dispensation of Heaven, really philosophic (λέγειν τε ἠναγκάσθην, ἐπαινῶν τὴν ὀρθὴν φιλοσοφίαν, ὡς ἐκ ταύτης ἔστιν τὰ τε πολιτικὰ δίκαια καὶ τὰ τῶν ἰδιωτῶν πάντα κατιδεῖν· κακῶν οὖν οὐ 326.b λήξειν τὰ ἀνθρώπινα γένη, πρὶν ἂν ἢ τὸ τῶν φιλοσοφούντων ὀρθῶς γε καὶ ἀληθῶς γένος εἰς ἀρχὰς ἔλθῃ τὰς πολιτικὰς ἢ τὸ τῶν δυναστευόντων ἐν ταῖς πόλεσιν ἐκ τινος μοίρας θείας ὄντως φιλοσοφίῃ.)

This was the view I held (Ταύτην δὴ τὴν διάνοιαν ἔχων) when I came to Italy and Sicily, ...

09 Ep. 7, 330c2–5

ὦν δὲ ἔνεκα καὶ ὅσα ἔπραξα, ὡς εἰκότα τε καὶ δίκαια, ὑμῖν πρῶτον μὲν συμβουλεύσας ἃ χρῆ ποιεῖν ἐκ τῶν νῦν γεγονότων, ὕστερον τὰ περὶ ταῦτα διέξειμι, τῶν ἐπανερωτώντων ἔνεκα τί δὴ βουλόμενος ἦλθον τὸ δεύτερον, ἵνα μὴ τὰ πάρεργα ὡς ἔργα μοι συμβαίη λεγόμενα. λέγω δὴ τάδε ἐγώ...

That my motives for doing so and all my actions were reasonable and just, all this I will try to explain later on, for the benefit of those who ask what object I had in going the second time. But first I must counsel you as to the course you ought to adopt in view of the present circumstances, so as not to give the first place to matters of secondary importance. What I have to say, then, is this: [*here follows the advice*]

10 Ep. 7, 327a1–4

ἐγὼ συγγενόμενος Δίῳι τότε νέῳ κινδυνεύω, τὰ δοκοῦντα ἐμοὶ βέλτιστα ἀνθρώποις εἶναι μηνύων διὰ λόγων καὶ πράττειν αὐτὰ συμβουλεύων, ἀγνοεῖν ὅτι τυραννίδος τινὰ τρόπον κατάλυσιν ἐσομένην μηχανώμενος ἐλάνθανον ἐμαυτόν.

When I associated with Dion, who was then a youth, instructing him verbally in what I believed was best for mankind and counselling him to realize it in action, it seems that I was not aware that I was, in a way, unwittingly contriving the future overthrow of the tyranny.

11a *Ep.* 7: 333c7–e6

ἀκούσαι χρὴ τοὺς (333.d) ἐμὲ παρακαλοῦντας πρὸς τὰ νῦν πράγματα. ἤλθον Ἀθηναῖος ἀνὴρ ἐγώ, ἐταῖρος Δίωνος, σύμμαχος αὐτῷ, πρὸς τὸν τύραννον, ὅπως ἀντὶ πολέμου φιλίαν ποιήσασιν· διαμαχόμενος δὲ τοῖς διαβάλλουσιν ἡττήθη. πείθοντος δὲ Διονυσίου τιμαῖς καὶ χρήμασιν γενέσθαι μετ' αὐτοῦ ἐμὲ μάρτυρά τε καὶ φίλον πρὸς τὴν εὐπρέπειαν τῆς ἐκβολῆς τῆς Δίωνος αὐτῷ γίνεσθαι, τούτων δὴ τὸ πᾶν διήμαρτεν. ὕστερον δὲ δὴ κατιῶν οἴκαδε (333.e) Δίῳ ἀδελφῷ δύο προσλαμβάνει Ἀθήνηθεν, οὐκ ἐκ φιλοσοφίας γεγονότε φίλω, ἀλλ' ἐκ τῆς περιτρεχούσης ἐταιρίας ταύτης τῆς τῶν πλείστων φίλων, ἣν ἐκ τοῦ ξενίζειν τε καὶ μυεῖν καὶ ἐποπτεύειν πραγματεύονται, καὶ δὴ καὶ τούτω τῷ συγκαταγαγόντε αὐτὸν φίλω ἐκ τούτων τε καὶ ἐκ τῆς πρὸς τὴν κάθοδον ὑπηρεσίας ἐγενέσθη ἐταίρω.

Those who are urging me to address myself [333d] to the affairs of today ought to hear what then took place. I, a citizen of Athens, a companion of Dion, an ally of his own, went to the tyrant in order that I might bring about friendship instead of war; but in my struggle with the slanderers I was worsted. But when Dionysius tried to persuade me by means of honors and gifts of money to side with him so that I should bear witness, as his friend, to the propriety of his expulsion of Dion, in this design he failed utterly. And later on, while returning home from exile, Dion attached to himself two brothers from Athens, [333e] men whose friendship was not derived from philosophy, but from the ordinary companionship out of which most friendships spring, and which comes from mutual entertaining and sharing in religion and mystic ceremonies. So, too, in the case of these two friends who accompanied him home; it was for these reasons and because of their assistance in his homeward voyage that they became his companions.

11b *Ep.* 7: 328c–d1

ταύτη μὲν δὴ τῇ διανοίᾳ τε καὶ τόλμῃ ἀπήρα οἴκοθεν, οὐχ ἢ τινες ἐδόξαζον, ἀλλ' αἱ σχυνόμενος μὲν ἑμαυτὸν τὸ μέγιστον, μὴ δόξαιμι ποτε ἑμαυτῷ παντάπασι λόγος μόνον ἀτεχνῶς εἶναι τίς, ἔργου δὲ οὐδενὸς ἂν ποτε ἐκὼν ἀνθάσασθαι, κινδυνεύσειν δὲ προδοῦναι πρῶτον (328d) μὲν τὴν Δίωνος ξενίαν τε καὶ ἐταιρίαν...

Holding this view and in this spirit of adventure it was that I set out from home,—not in the spirit which some have supposed, but dreading self-reproach most of all, lest haply I should seem to myself to be utterly and absolutely nothing more than a mere voice and never to undertake willingly any action, and now to be in danger of proving false, in the first instance, to my friendship and association with Dion...

12 *Ep.* 7: Philosophical digression

Peira (340b1–341a6)

Verdict against what(ever) Dionysius II wrote (341a7–c3)

Plato never wrote about these things: σπινθήρ and συζῆν (341a7–342a5)

Digression: The 'Four' (ὄνομα, λόγος, εἶδωλον, ἐπιστήμη) (342a5–344d2)

Definite verdict about what(ever) Dionysius II wrote (344d3–c2)

13 *Ep.* 13, beginning (360a1–c5. 361a1–7) (transl. Bury)

Πλάτων Διονυσίῳ τυράννῳ Συρακουσῶν εὖ πράττειν.

Ἀρχή σοι τῆς ἐπιστολῆς ἔστω καὶ ἅμα σύμβολον ὅτι παρ' ἐμοῦ ἐστὶν· τοὺς Λοκρούς ποθ' ἐστιῶν νεανίσκους, πόρρω κατακείμενος ἀπ' ἐμοῦ, ἀνέστης παρ' ἐμὲ καὶ φιλοφρονούμενος εἶπες εὖ τι ῥήμα ἔχον, ὡς ἔμοιγε ἐδόκει καὶ (360.b) τῷ παρακατακειμένῳ ἦν δ' οὗτος τῶν καλῶν τις δὲ τότε εἶπεν· Ἡ που πολλά, ὦ Διονύσιε, εἰς σοφίαν ὠφελῆ ὑπὸ Πλάτωνος· σὺ δ' εἶπες· Καὶ εἰς ἄλλα πολλά, ἐπεὶ καὶ ἀπ' αὐτῆς τῆς μεταπέμψεως, ὅτι μετεπεμψάμην αὐτόν, δι' αὐτὸ τοῦτο εὐθὺς ὠφελήθη. τοῦτ' οὖν διασωστέον, ὅπως ἂν αὐξάνηται αἰεὶ ἡμῶν ἢ ἀπ' ἀλλήλων ὠφελία.

καὶ ἐγὼ νῦν τοῦτ' αὐτὸ παρασκευάζων, τῶν τε Πυθαγορείων πέμπω σοι καὶ τῶν διαιρέσεων, καὶ ἄνδρα, ὡς περ ἐδόκει ἡμῖν τότε, (360.c) ὃ γε σὺ καὶ Ἀρχύτης, εἶπερ ἦκει παρὰ σε Ἀρχύτης, χρῆσθαι δύναισθ' ἂν. ἔστι δὲ ὄνομα μὲν Ἑλίκων, τὸ δὲ γένος ἐκ Κυζίκου, μαθητῆς δὲ Εὐδόξου καὶ περὶ πάντα τὰ ἐκείνου πάνυ χαριέντως ἔχων. ...

Περὶ δὲ ὧν ἐπέστελλές μοι ἀποπέμπειν σοι, τὸν μὲν Ἀπόλλω ἐποίησάμην τε καὶ ἄγει σοι Λεπτίνης, νέου καὶ ἀγαθοῦ δημιουργοῦ· ὄνομα δ' ἔστιν αὐτῷ Λεωχάρης. ἕτερον δὲ παρ' αὐτῷ ἔργον ἦν πάνυ κομψόν, ὡς

ἔδόκει ἐπριάμην οὖν αὐτὸ βουλόμενός σου τῇ γυναικὶ δοῦναι, ὅτι μου ἔπε μελεῖτο καὶ ὑγιαίνοντος καὶ ἀσθενοῦντος ἀξίως ἐμοῦ τε καὶ σοῦ. ... πέμπω δὲ καὶ οἴνου γλυκέος δώδεκα σταμνία τοῖς παισὶ καὶ μέλιτος δύο.

Plato to Dionysius, Tyrant of Syracuse, wishes well-doing.

Let this greeting not only commence my letter but serve at the same time as a token that it is from me. Once when you were feasting the Locrian youths and were seated at a distance from me, you got up and came over to me and in a friendly spirit made some remark [360b] which I thought excellent, as also did my neighbor at the table, who was one of the beautiful youths. And he then said—"No doubt, Dionysius, you find Plato of great benefit as regards philosophy!" And you replied—"Yes, and in regard to much else; since from the very moment of my inviting him I derived benefit at once from the very fact that I had invited him." This tone, then, should be carefully preserved, in order that the mutual benefit we derive from one another may always go on increasing. So by way of helping towards this end I am now sending you some of the Pythagorean works and of the "Divisions," and also, as we arranged at that time, a man of whom [360c] you and Archytas—if Archytas has come to your court—may be able to make use. His name is Helicon, he is a native of Cyzicus, and he is a pupil of Eudoxus and exceedingly well versed in all his doctrine.

....

As regards the things you wrote to me to send you, I have had the Apollo made and Leptines is bringing it to you. It is by a young and good craftsman named Leochares. He had at his shop another piece which was, as I thought, very artistic; so I bought it with the intention of presenting it to your wife, because she tended me both in health and sickness in a manner which did credit both to you and to me. ... I am also sending twelve jars of sweet wine for the children [361b] and two of honey. ...

Persons mentioned in *Ep.* 13: Dionysius II (tyrant of Syracuse, addressee), his wife, his children – young men from Locri (anon.) – Archytas (Pythagorean) – Helicon of Cyzicus (the mathematician?), pupil of Eudoxus (of Knidos, the mathematician), (indirectly) of Isocrates (the orator), (through Polyxenus) of Bryson (of Heracleia, mathematician) – Leptines ((1) relative of Dionysius II? (2) the Pythagorean, murderer of Callipus?) – Leochares (sculptor) – Plato's mother, his nieces, their husbands and their daughters – Dio of Syracuse – Speusippus (Plato's nephew/pupil) – Andromedes from Aegina (otherwise unknown) – Erastos (pupil of Plato, see *Ep.* 6) – Cratinus, brother of Timotheos (the politician) – Cebes (of Thebes), interlocutor *Phd.*, the dialogue which features: Simmias and Socrates – Philagrus, Philaides, ambassadors of the king of Persia – Terillus (friend of Plato, otherwise unknown), brother-in-law of Teison, "city-steward of Syracuse" (Nails) – Aristocritus (*cf.* *Ep.* 3, otherwise unknown) – Iatrocles (freed slave)

14 *Ep.* 13, 363c9/d1

Ἔρρωσο καὶ φιλοσόφει καὶ τοὺς ἄλλους προτρέπου τοὺς 363.d νεωτέρους, καὶ τοὺς συσφαιριστὰς ἀσπάζου ὑπὲρ ἐμοῦ,... – Keep well and study philosophy and exhort thereto [363d] all the other young men; and greet for me your comrades at the game of ball / in your study of the *sphere*-model ?...

15 *Ep.* 13, 362e2–7

Τὰ μετὰ ταῦτα περὶ Δίωνος λέγοιμ' ἄν. τὰ μὲν ἄλλ' οὐπω ἔχω λέγειν, πρὶν ἂν παρὰ σοῦ ἔλθωσιν αἱ ἐπιστολαί, ὥσπερ ἔφησ' περὶ μέντοι ἐκείνων ὧν οὐκ εἶας μεμνήσθαι πρὸς αὐτόν, οὔτε ἐμνήσθην οὔτε διελέχθην, ἐξεπειρώμην δὲ εἴτε χαλεπῶς εἴτε ῥαδίως οἷσει γιγνομένων, καὶ μοι ἔδόκει οὐκ ἡρέμα ἂν ἄχθεσθαι εἰ γίγνοιτο. τὰ δὲ ἄλλα περὶ σὲ καὶ λόγῳ καὶ ἔργῳ μέτριός μοι δοκεῖ εἶναι Δίων.

In the next place I shall speak about Dion. Other matters I cannot speak of as yet, until the letters from you arrive, as you said; with regard, however, to those matters which you forbade me to mention to him, I neither mentioned nor discussed them, but I did try to discover whether he would take their occurrence hardly or calmly, and it seemed to me that if they occurred it would cause him no small vexation. As to all else Dion's attitude towards you seems to me to be reasonable both in word and deed.

16 *Ep.* 13, 360d1f.

δεδιῶς δὲ λέγω ταῦτα, ὅτι ὑπὲρ ἀνθρώπου δόξαν ἀποφαίνομαι, οὐ φαύλου ζῴου ἀλλ' εὐμεταβόλου, πλὴν πάνυ ὀλίγων τινῶν καὶ εἰς ὀλίγα:...

This, however, I say with trepidation, since I am uttering an opinion about a man, and man though not a worthless is an inconstant creature, save in very few instances and in few respects.